



Samuel Lebens – University of Haifa

אֲךָ בַחֲמִשָּׁה עָשָׂר יוֹם לַחֹדֶשׁ הַשְּׁבִיעִי בְּאַסְפֹּכֶם אֶת־תְּבוּאֹת הָאָרֶץ תַּחֲגֹזוּ אֶת־חַג־יְהוָה שִׁבְעַת יָמִים בַּיּוֹם הָרִאשׁוֹן שִׁבְתֹּן וּבַיּוֹם הַשְּׁמִינִי שִׁבְתֹּן: וּלְקַחְתֶּם לָכֶם בַּיּוֹם הָרִאשׁוֹן פְּרֵי עֵץ הַדָּר פֶּת תְּמָרִים וְעֵנָף יַעֲזֹבֶת וְעַרְבֵי־גַחַל וּשְׂמַחְתֶּם לִפְנֵי יְהוָה אֱלֹהֵיכֶם שִׁבְעַת יָמִים: וְחַגְתֶּם אֹתוֹ חַג לַיהוָה שִׁבְעַת יָמִים בַּשָּׁנָה חֻקַּת עוֹלָם לְדֹרֹתֵיכֶם בַּחֹדֶשׁ הַשְּׁבִיעִי תַחֲגֹזוּ אֹתוֹ: בְּסֻפֹת תִּשְׁבּוּ שִׁבְעַת יָמִים כָּל־הָאֶזְרָח בְּיִשְׂרָאֵל יִשְׁבּוּ בְּסֻפֹת: לְמַעַן יִדְעוּ דֹרֹתֵיכֶם כִּי בְּסֻפֹת הוֹשַׁבְתִּי אֶת־בְּנֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל בְּהוֹצִיאִי אֹתָם מֵאֶרֶץ מִצְרַיִם אֲנִי יְהוָה אֱלֹהֵיכֶם:

And you shall take for yourself, on the first day [of this festival] the fruit of goodly trees, branches of palm-trees, and branches of thick trees, and willows of the brook, and you shall rejoice before the LORD your God for seven days. And you shall celebrate it as a feast for the LORD seven days in the year. It is an eternal statute for the generations; you shall celebrate it in the seventh month.

You shall dwell in booths [for the] seven days [of this festival]; every citizen of Israel shall dwell in booths; in order that future generations will know that I made the Israelite people live in booths when I brought them out of the land of Egypt, I the LORD your God.

**(Leviticus 23:39-43)**

תִּנְיָא רַבִּי אֱלִיעֶזֶר אוֹמֵר: כְּשֵׁם שְׂאִין אָדָם יוֹצֵא יָדֵי חוּבְתוֹ בַּיּוֹם טוֹב הָרִאשׁוֹן שֶׁל חַג בְּלוּלָבוּ שֶׁל חֲבִירוֹ, דְּכִתִּיב: "וּלְקַחְתֶּם לָכֶם בַּיּוֹם הָרִאשׁוֹן פְּרֵי עֵץ הַדָּר פֶּת תְּמָרִים" — מְשַׁלְּכֶם, כִּי אֵין אָדָם יוֹצֵא יָדֵי חוּבְתוֹ בְּסוּפֹתוֹ שֶׁל חֲבִירוֹ, דְּכִתִּיב: "חַג הַסּוּכוֹת תַּעֲשֶׂה לָּךְ שִׁבְעַת יָמִים" — מְשַׁלְּךָ. וְחֻקִּים אוֹמְרִים: אַף עַל פִּי שְׂאֵמְרוּ אֵין אָדָם יוֹצֵא יָדֵי חוּבְתוֹ בַּיּוֹם טוֹב הָרִאשׁוֹן בְּלוּלָבוּ שֶׁל חֲבִירוֹ, אֲבָל יוֹצֵא יָדֵי חוּבְתוֹ בְּסוּפֹתוֹ שֶׁל חֲבִירוֹ, דְּכִתִּיב: "כָּל הָאֶזְרָח בְּיִשְׂרָאֵל יִשְׁבּוּ בְּסוּכוֹת", מְלַמֵּד שֶׁכָּל יִשְׂרָאֵל רְאוּיִם לִישֵׁב בְּסוּכָה אַחַת. וְרַבְּנֵנוּ, הַאי "לָךְ", מַאי דְרָשִׁי בֵּיה? מִיבְעֵי לִיה לְמַעוּטֵי גְזוּלָה, אֲבָל שְׂאוּלָה כְּתִיב: "כָּל הָאֶזְרָח". וְרַבִּי אֱלִיעֶזֶר, הַאי "כָּל הָאֶזְרָח" מַאי עֲבִיד לִיה? מִיבְעֵי לִיה לְגַר שְׁנַתְּגִיר בֵּינְתִים וְקִטְוֹן שְׁנַתְּגַדֵּל בֵּינְתִים. וְרַבְּנֵנוּ? כִּיֹּן שְׂאֵמְרוּ: עוֹשִׂין סוּכָה בְּחוּלוֹ שֶׁל מוֹעֵד, לָא אֲצִטְרִידָה קְרָא.

It is taught that Rabbi Eliezer says: Just as a person does not fulfill his obligation on the first day of the Festival with the lulav of another, as it is written: "And you shall take for yourselves on the first day the fruit of a beautiful tree, branches of a date palm" (Leviticus 23:40), from your own [and not from that of someone else], so too, a person does not fulfill his obligation with the sukka of another, as it is written: "You shall prepare for yourself the festival of Sukkot for seven days" (Deuteronomy 16:13), from your own. And the Rabbis say: Although they said that a person does not fulfill his obligation on the first day of the Festival with the lulav of another, he [does] fulfill his obligation with the sukka of another, as it is written: "All the homeborn in Israel shall reside in sukkot" (Leviticus 23:42). This teaches that all of the Jewish people are fit to reside in one sukka.

And the Rabbis, what do they derive from this term "for yourself"?

They require that term to exclude a stolen [sukka]. However, [with regard to] a borrowed [sukka], it is written: "All the homeborn."

And Rabbi Eliezer, what does he do with this term: "All the homeborn"? He requires [that term] to [derive that] a convert who converted in the interim, and a minor who reached majority in the interim, [are obligated to fulfill the mitzva of residing in a sukkah].

And according to the Rabbis? Once [the Sages] said that one may establish a sukkah during the intermediate days of the Festival, [an additional] verse is not necessary [to derive the obligation of the convert and the minor who reached majority].

**(Tractate Sukka 27b)**

אמר רבי לוי מי שלוקח לולב גזול למה הדבר דומה ללסטים שיושב בפּרשת דרכים ומקפח לעוברים ושבים, חד זמן עבר עליו חד לגיון למגבי דימוסא דההיא מדינתא קם קדמיה וקפחיה ונסב כל מה דהוה בידיה, בתרא יומין אצתיד ההוא ליסטא ואתחבש בפילקי, שמע ההוא לגיונא ואזל לגביה ואמר ליה הב לי מה דקפחתי ואנא מליף עליך זכו קדם מלפא, אמר ליה מן כל מה דקפחתי ומן כל מה דנסבית לית ליה לההוא גברא פלום, אלא הדין טפיטא דתחזתי והוא מן דידך, אמר ליה הב יתה לי ואנא מליף עליך זכו קדם מלפא, אמר ליה נסביה. אמר ליה תהוי ידע דאת עליל למחר קדם מלפא לדינא והוא שאיל ואמר לך אית לך בר נש מליף עליך זכו, ואת אמר ליה אית לגיון פלן מליף עלי זכו, והוא משלח וקרי לי ואנא אתי למילף עליך זכו קדמוי, למחר אוקימתיה קדם מלפא בדינא, שאל ליה מלפא אמר ליה אית לך בר נש מליף עליך זכו, אמר ליה אית לגיון פלוני מליף עלי זכו. שלח מלפא וקריא ליה, אמר ליה חכם את על הדין גברא זכו, אמר ליה חכם אנא כד שלחתי למגבי דימוסא דההוא מדינתא קם קדמי וקפח ונסב כל מה דהוה עמי והדין טפיטא דהוא מן דידי מסהיד עלוי, כל העם צוחין ואמרין אוי לו לזה שנעשה סניגורו קטיגורו. כף אדם לוקח לולב לזכות בו, ואם הנה גזול צונח לפני הקדוש ברוך הוא ואומר גזול אני חמוס אני, ומלאכי השרת אומרים אוי לזה שנעשה סניגורו קטיגורו.

Rabbi Levi said, he who takes a stolen *lulav*, to what can it be compared? To a bandit that sat at a cross road, and robbed from passersby. One time, a legate passed by, in order to collect tax from that province. [The bandit] stood before him and robbed him, and took all that he had in his hand. After some time that bandit was caught. He was incarcerated in prison.

The legate heard, and he came to him, and said to him, "Give me that which you stole from me, and I will provide a positive character reference before the king."

He said to him, "From all that I stole, and from all that I took, I have nothing left at all, other than this mat that is under me, and that was from you."

He said to him, "Give it to me, and I will provide a positive character reference before the king."

He said, "Let it be given to him."

He said, "You should know that you are going to be called tomorrow before the king for judgement. He will ask you and say to you, "Is there someone willing to provide a positive character reference?" And you should say that there is this legate who will provide a positive character reference, and he will send and call for me, and I will come and provide a positive character reference before him.

The next day, he was stood up before the king in judgement. The King asked him, saying, "Is there someone willing to be a positive character reference for you?" He replied, "Yes, the Legate (So-and-So) will provide a positive character reference." The king sent and called for him, and said to him, "You are wise. Is this person meritorious?" He responded, "I am wise. When you sent me to collect taxes in that providence, he stood before me and robbed me, and took all that I had with me, and this mat, which was mine, testifies against him."

All the people cried out, and said, "Woe unto him whose defence counsel becomes a prosecutor!"

So too, a person takes a *lulav* to accrue merit with it, and if it was stolen, it shouts out before the Holy One, blessed be He, and says, "I am stolen! I am plundered!" And the ministering angels say, "Woe unto him whose defence counsel becomes a prosecutor!"

**(Vayikra Rabba 30:6)**

---

Each of us would have, in two ways, affirmed himself, and the other person. (1) In my production I would have objectified my individuality, its specific character, and, therefore, enjoyed not only an individual manifestation of my life during the activity, but also, when looking at the object, I would have the individual pleasure of knowing my personality to be objective, visible to the senses, and, hence, a power beyond all doubt. (2) In your enjoyment, or use, of my product I would have the direct enjoyment both of being conscious of having satisfied a human need by my work, that is, of having objectified man's essential nature, and of having thus created an object corresponding to the need of another man's essential nature ... Our products would be so many mirrors in which we saw reflected our essential nature.

**(Marx, Karl. "Comment on James Mill," in Economic and Philosophical Manuscripts of 1844.)**

---

The distinguishing feature of Communism is not the abolition of property generally, but the abolition of bourgeois property.

**(Communist Manifesto)**

---

The Sukkah negates material possessions as ultimate value; the *lulav* links us again with our dependence upon our goods and chattels. The sukkah teaches us not to appraise too highly our worldly goods, the *lulav* to value them at their true worth. The sukkah raises us above our property to God alone; the *lulav* teaches us to be imbued with the spirit of God and even to exalt our possessions as God-given. The sukkah prevents us from becoming too earthly, the *lulav* reminds us not to soar too high above the earthly. The sukkah protects us from becoming debased by our wealth, the *lulav* teaches us to cherish our possessions and dedicate them to sacred purposes as the gift of God. The lesson of the sukkah is that the acquisition of goods is not the sole aim of life; the *lulav* teaches us to apprehend goods as instruments for our way of life before God; and so it brings us שמחה, joy in living before God, in a life of godliness. For if life is understood thus, it makes no difference whether you attain much or little; the assessment of your life lies in whether you have lived it dutifully with your much or your little.

**(Horeb, Rabbi Hirsch, §223)**