# Shemitah: Radical Perspectives

# Part 1: the Individual

## 1. Gittin 36a

הַלֵּל הַתַּקִין פַּרוֹסְבּוּל מפני תיקון עולם

ּהָנֵן הָתָם פְּרוֹסְבּוּל אֵינוֹ מְשַׁמֵט זֶה אֶחָד מִן הַדְּבָרִים שֶׁהִתְקִין הִלֵּל הַזָּקֵן שֶׁרָאָה אֶת הָעָם שֶׁנִּמְנְעוּ מִלְּהַלְווֹת זֶה אֶת זֶה וְעָבְרוּ עַל מַה שֵׁכַּתוּב בַּתּוֹרָה הִשַּׁמֵר לָךּ פֵּן יִהְיֶה דָבַר עִם לְבַבָּךְ בָלִיַּעַל וְגוֹ׳ עַמֵד וָהָתִקִין פָּרוֹסְבּוּל §

The mishna taught that Hillel the Elder instituted the prosbol (a document that prevents the Sabbatical Year from abrogating an outstanding debt) for the betterment of the world. We learned in a mishna there (Shevi'it 10:3): If one writes a prosbol, the Sabbatical Year does not abrogate debt. This is one of the matters that Hillel the Elder instituted because he saw that the people of the nation were refraining from lending to one another around the time of the Sabbatical Year, as they were concerned that the debtor would not repay the loan, and they violated that which is written in the Torah: "Beware that there be not a base thought in your heart, saying: The seventh year, the year of release, is at hand; and your eye be evil against your needy brother, and you give him nothing" (Deuteronomy 15:9). He arose and instituted the prosbol so that it would also be possible to collect those debts in order to ensure that people would continue to give loans.

### 2. Bava Batra 10a

ָרַב פָּפָּא הָוָה סָלֵיק בְּדַרְגָּא אִישְׁתְּמִיט כַּרְעֵיה בָּעֵי לְמִיפַּל אֲמֵר הַשְׁתָּא (כֵּן) [כּוּ] אִיחַיַּיב מַאן דְּסָנֵי לַן כִּמְחַלְּלֵי שַׁבָּתוֹת אַמַר לִיה חָיַיא בַּר רַב מִדְּפָתִי לְרַב פָּפָּא שֵׁמָא עָנִי בָּא לִיַדְדְּ וְלֹא פִּרְנַסְתּוֹ

The Gemara relates: Rav Pappa was once climbing up a ladder when his foot slipped and he almost fell. He said: Now, is the one who hates us, a euphemism for himself, liable like Shabbat desecrators and idol worshippers, who are subject to death by stoning, which is similar to death by falling, the punishment that Rav Pappa narrowly escaped? Hiyya bar Rav of Difti said to Rav Pappa: Perhaps a poor person once approached you and you did not sustain him, and therefore you were given a glimpse of the punishment that you actually deserve.

דְּתַנְיָא רַבִּי יְהוֹשֵׁעַ בֶּן קֶרְחָה אוֹמֵר כָּל הַמַּצֵלִים עֵינָיו מִן הַצְּדָקָה כְּאִילוּ עוֹבֵד עֲבוֹדָה זָרָה כְּתִיב הָכָא הִשָּׁמֶר לְּךּ כָּן יִהְיֶה דָבֵר עִם לְבַבָּךְ בָּלִיַעַל וּכְתִיב הַתָּם יַצָאוּ אֲנַשִּׁים בָּנֵי בָלִיַּעַל מֵה לְהַלָּן עֲבוֹדָה זַרָה אַף כַּאן עֲבוֹדָה זַרָה

As it is taught in a baraita: Rabbi Yehoshua ben Korḥa says: Anyone who turns his eyes away from one seeking charity it is as if he worships idols. From where is this derived? It is written here: "Beware that there be not a base thought in your heart...and your eye be evil against your poor brother, and you give him nothing" (Deuteronomy 15:9). And it is written there: "Certain base men have gone out...and have drawn away the inhabitants of their city, saying, Let us go and serve other gods" (Deuteronomy 13:14). Just as there, the base men sin with idolatry, so too here, idolatry.

### 3. Gittin 36a (continued)

ּוּמִי אִיכָּא מִידֵי דְּמִדְּאוֹרָיִיתָא מְשַׁמְּטָא שָׁבִיעִית וְהָתָקין הַלֵּל דְּלָא מְשַׁמְּטָא?? אָמַר אַבָּיֵי בַּשְּׁבִיעִית בִּזְמַן הַזֶּה וְרַבִּי הִיא...

The Gemara asks about the *prosbol* itself: **But is there anything** like this, **where by Torah law the Sabbatical** Year **cancels** the debt **but Hillel instituted that it does not cancel** the debt? **Abaye said:** The *baraita* is referring **to the Sabbatical** Year **in the present,** and **it is** in accordance with the opinion of **Rabbi** Yehuda HaNasi that both the Jubilee year and the shemita were no longer Biblically mandated at that time

וַתַקּינוּ רַבָּנַן דְתָשַׁמֵּט זֵכֵר לַשָּׁבִיעִית רָאָה הָלֵל שַׁנָּמִנָעוּ הָעָם מִלְּהַלְווֹת זֶה אֶת זֶה עַמַד וְהָתְקִין פָּרוֹסְבּוּל

And the Sages instituted that despite this, the Sabbatical Year still will abrogate debt in the present, in remembrance of the Torah-mandated Sabbatical Year. Hillel saw that the people of the nation refrained from lending to each other so he arose and instituted the *prosbol*. According to this explanation, the ordinance of Hillel did not conflict with a Torah law; rather, he added an ordinance to counter the effect of a rabbinic law..

## 4. Ethics of the Fathers (Pirkei Avot) Chapter 5: 10

אַרָבַּע מִדּוֹת בָּאָדָם. הָאוֹמֵר שֵׁלִּי שֲלִי וְשֵׁלְּךְ שֵׁלֶּרְ, זוֹ מִדָּה בֵינוֹנִית. וְיֵשׁ אוֹמְרִים, זוֹ מִדַּת סְדוֹם.

ָשֶׁלִּי שֶׁלְּךָ וְשֶׁלְּךָ שֶׁלִּי, עַם הָאָרֶץ. שֶׁלִּי שֶׁלְּי וְשֶׁלְךָ שֶׁלָּךְ, חָסִיד. שֶׁלִּי שֶׁלִּי וְשֶׁלְךְ שֶׁלִי, רָשְׁע:

There are four types of character in human beings:

One that says: "mine is mine, and yours is yours": this is a commonplace type (or: the middle road); and some say this is a sodom-type of character (or: the quality of Sodom)

[One that says:] "mine is yours and yours is mine": is an unlearned person;

[One that says:] "mine is yours and yours is yours" is a pious person.

[One that says:] "mine is mine, and yours is mine" is a wicked person.

# Part 2: God's Land, God's World

#### 5. Leviticus Rabbah Chapter 26

וַיּאֹמֶר ה' אֶל משֶׁה אֱמֹר אֶל הַכּּהֲנִים, זֶה שֶׁאָמֵר הַכָּתוּב )<u>תהלים יט, ג</u> :(יוֹם לְיוֹם יַבִּיעַ אֹמֶר, תַּנְיָא בְּאֶסָד בִּתְקוּפַת נִיסָן וּבְאֶסָד בִּתְקוּפַת תִּשְׁרֵי הַיּוֹם וְהַלֹּיְלָה שָׁוִין, מִכָּאן וְאֵילָךְ הַיּוֹם לֹוֶה מִן הַלֹּיְלָה וְהַלֹּיְלָה מִן הַיּוֹם וּפוֹרְעִין זֶה לָזֶה בְּפִיּוּסִין, הַכֹּל בְּלִי שְׁטַר וּבְלִי גְזַר דִּין, הֱוֵי: יוֹם לְיוֹם וגו', אֲבָל לְמַטֶּה כַּמָּה שְׁטָרוֹת וְכַמָּה גְּזַר דִּין , )תהלים יט, ה :(בְּכָל הָאָרֵץ יָצָא קָוָם,

"Day unto day utters speech..their voice is unheard..." (Psalms 19:3)

On the first day of the 'tekufa' of Tishrei and the first day of the 'tekufa' of Nissan (the vernal and autumnal equinoxes), the day and night are equal. From then onwards the day borrows from the night and the night from the day, and they repay each other amicably, everything being done without legal document or judicial verdict...Here below, however, what a multitude of legal documents and what a multitude of judicial verdicts are required, "Their line goes out through all the earth."

#### 6. Exodus Rabbah Chapter 31

בּוֹא וּרָאֵה כָּל בָּרִיּוֹתָיו שֵׁל הַקָּדוֹשׁ בָּרוּךְ הוּא לוִין זֵה מְזֵּה,

ָהַיּוֹם לֹזֶה מִן הַלֵּילָה וְהַלַּיְלָה מִן הַיּוֹם, וְאֵינָן דְּנִין זֶה עִם זֶה כַּבְּרִיוֹת, שֶׁנֶּאֱמֵר )<u>תהלים יט, ג</u> :(יוֹם לְיוֹם יַבִּיעַ אֹמֶר. הַלְּבָנָה לֹזָה מִן הַכּוֹכְבִים וְהַכּוֹכְבִים מִן הַלְּבָנָה,. הָאוֹר לֹזֶה מִן הַשֶּׁמֶשׁ וְהַשֶּׁמֶשׁ מִן הָאוֹר, הַסְּכְמָה לֹזָה מִן הַבְּינָה וְהַבִּינָה מִן הַסָּכְמָה,. הַשְּׁמִיִם לוֹין מִן הָאָרֶץ וְהָאֶרֶץ מֵהַשְּמִים,. הַחֶּסֶד לֹזֶה מִן הַצְּדָקָה וְהַצְּדָקָה מִן הַחָּסֶד הַתּוֹרָה לֹזָה מִן הַמִּצְוֹוֹת וְהַמִּצְוֹוֹת מִן הַתּוֹרָה, , בְּרִיּוֹתָיו שֶׁל הַקְּדוֹשׁ בְּרוּךְ הוּא לוֹין זֶה מִיָּה וְעוֹשִׁים שָׁלוֹם זֶה עִם זֶה בְּלֹא דְבָרִים, בָּשִּׁר וְדָם לוֹה מֵחַבֵּרוֹ וִמִּבָּקשׁ לְבָלְעוֹ בְּרָבִּית וּבְנָזְל...

Come and see how all God's creations borrow from one another, day borrows from night and night from day. But they do not go to law with each other like mortals do...The moon borrows from the stars and the stars from the moon....wisdom and understanding...righteousness and lovingkindness...Torah and mitzvoth...God's creatures borrow from each other and make peace with each other without words. Human beings borrow from each other and attempt to swallow each other up...

#### 7. Sifra to Leviticus[

ח] "והארץ לא תמכר לצמִתֻת"-- לחולטנית. "כי לי הארץ"-- אל תרע עיניך בה. "כי גרים ותושבים אתם.."-- אל תעשו עצמכם עיקר. וכן הוא אומר) <u>דברי הימים א כט, טו</u>" :(כי גרים אנחנו לפניך ותושבים ככל אבותינו". וכן דוד אומר) <u>תהלים לט, יג</u>" :(כי גר אנכי עמך תו "אתם עמדי"-- דיו לעבד שיהיה כרבו. כשתהיה שלי הרי הוא שלכם(Vayikra 25:23) (8. "And the land shall not be sold litzmituth, for Mine is the land; for strangers and settlers are you with Me."

"litzmituth": in perpetuity. "for Mine is the land": Do not take it amiss, then, (that I forbid this to you for is is not yours). "for strangers and settlers are you": Do not make yourselves foremost. And thus is it written (I Chronicles 29:15) "For we are strangers with You and sojourners, as all of our fathers." And thus did David say (Tehillim 39:13) "For a stranger am I with You, a sojourner, as all of my fathers." "are you with Me": It suffices the servant that he emulate his master. "When you are Mine, it (Eretz Yisrael) will be yours.

If you go in My ways you will be settled and if not you will just be temporary dwellers before me...Do not think that once you entered the land it is totally yours especially after many generations...rather it is always God's and in every generation he gives it to us on condition that we keep His commandments as Joshua instructed. And even David said: although I am King I am still a sojourner...When you go in My ways the Shechina will dwell in the land and you will be with Me... (based on commentary by Rabbi Kasher)

### 8. Brakhot 35a

ָּתָנוּ רַבְּנַן: אָסוּר לוֹ לָאָדָם שֶׁיֵהָנֶה מִן הָעוֹלָם הַזֶּה בְּלֹא בְּרָכָה. וְכָל הַנְּהֶנֶה מִן הָעוֹלָם הַזֶּה בְּלֹא בְּרָכָה

The Sages taught in a *Tosefta*: One is forbidden to derive benefit from this world, which is the property of God, without reciting a blessing beforehand. And anyone who derives benefit from this world without a blessing, it is as if he is guilty of misuse of a consecrated object.

אָמֵר רַב יְהוּדָה אָמַר שְׁמוּאֵל: כָּל הַנֶּהֶנֶה מָן הָעוֹלָם הַזֶּה בְּלֹא בְּרָכָה כְּאִילוּ נֶהֶנָה מִקֶּדְשֵׁי שָׁמַיִם, שֶׁנֶּאֱמַר: ״לַה׳ הָאָרֶץ וּמַלוֹאה״.

ָרַבִּי לֵוִי רָמֵי: כְּתִיב ״לַה׳ הָאָרֶץ וּמְלוֹאָהּ״, וּכְתִיב ״הַשָּׁמַיִם שָׁמַיִם לַה׳ וְהָאָרֶץ נָתַן לְבְנֵי אָדָם״! לָא קִשְׁיָא כָּאן קוֹדֶם בְּרָכָה כַּאן לָאָחֶר בְּרַכַה

Similarly, Rav Yehuda said that Shmuel said: One who derives benefit from this world without a blessing, it is as if he enjoyed objects consecrated to the heavens, as it is stated: "The earth and all it contains is the Lord's, the world and all those who live in it" (Psalms 24:1). Rabbi Levi expressed this concept differently.

Rabbi Levi raised a contradiction: It is written: "The earth and all it contains is the Lord's," and it is written elsewhere: "The heavens are the Lord's and the earth He has given over to mankind" (Psalms 115:16). There is clearly a contradiction with regard to whom the earth belongs. He himself resolves the contradiction: This is not difficult. Here, the verse that says that the earth is the Lord's refers to the situation before a blessing is recited, . and here, where it says that He gave the earth to mankind refers to after a blessing is recited.